



Town of Apex Transit Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

January 11, 2023

4:00pm-5:30pm

3rd Floor Training Room, Apex Town Hall

Meeting Purpose

The main purposes of this meeting were to: update the TAC members on the GoApex initial performance data and transit-related projects in Town and in the region, as well as discuss other Town projects and regional projects.

Meeting Outcomes

Town staff will follow up with TAC members to set a special meeting date to discuss the proposed bus stop improvement policy. Staff will also follow up to provide information based on requests made in the meeting.

Attendees

Committee members:

- Linda Barrett
(joined at Item 3)
- Nick Bryant
- Amanda Bunce,
ex officio
(remote)
- Joanna Helms,
ex officio
- Kurt Pfeifer
(remote)
- Angela Reincke,
ex officio
(remote)
- Stuart Wagner
- Andrew Werking

Staff support:

- Shannon Cox
- Katie Schwing
- Lauren Sisson

Guests:

- Councilor Brett Gantt (Apex Town Council)

Absent:

- David Yokum

1. Welcome and Introductions



- Chair Stuart Wagner opened the meeting at 4:04 pm and welcomed the members and guests. The meeting was simultaneously conducted in person and members Angela Reincke, Amanda Bunce, and Kurt Pfeiffer attended remotely. The meeting was also livestreamed to the Town's YouTube page.

2. Meeting Minutes

(Action Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

The committee reviewed the draft minutes from the October 12, 2022 meeting. There were no corrections noted.

Requested Action: Approve meeting minutes from the October 12, 2022 meeting.

- Member Andy Werking made a motion to approve the October 12, 2022 meeting minutes.
- Member Nick Bryant seconded the motion to approve the October 12, 2022 meeting minutes.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.

3. GoApex Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Katie Schwing provided updates on GoApex ridership and performance data.

Discussion:

- Fixed Route:
 - The committee asked for reminders about how "on-time" is measured. Katie provided that it is measured from departures at timepoint stops that are less than one minute early and five minutes late.
 - Committee members wondered if the bus is generally running early (based on their observations).
 - Committee members wondered about the stop in Beaver Creek, whether construction at Zeno Road is causing an issue.
 - ACTION: Katie will ask for additional information from Town of Cary, confirm bus is holding at time points when they are running early, and see if there are any specific stops that are especially problematic.
 - ACTION: Katie will ask for ridership information for the Wake Forest Circulator as a point of comparison for GoApex Route 1.
 - Committee asked if we know why ridership is spiking on some days. Staff discussed that the reasons are unknown but there is suspicion possibly not all riders are being manually counted every day. Town of Cary indicated they are going to review the importance of counting again with operators.
 - ACTION: Committee asked for comparison between manual and APC data to see if they are aligning. Katie also noted that APCs tend to overcount and manual counts tend to be slightly low.
- Door to Door:
 - Linda noted follow up conversation about limitations about service area. Possible follow up with other transit providers so that WakeMed has a clear understanding of



opportunities for trips. Healthcare providers want to be sure the service will work for their patients if they recommend that as a service. Looking forward to future possibilities to help with that.

- ACTION: Katie to coordinate with Town of Cary's demand response service as well.

4. Town Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing and Shannon Cox, Town of Apex)

Katie provided updates on the following projects:

- Bus Stop Sidewalk Art Project
Call for Artists is now available online
Open through Friday, March 17th, 2023
- Proposed Bus Stop Improvements Policy and Process
Katie introduced the idea of developing a policy based on the principles of transparency, equity, and safety to help identify and prioritize improvements.
 - Discussion:
 - Andy asked if the Town has an overall plan/goal for bus stop improvements (e.g., 100% of stops have a shelter by x)? If so, how are we doing toward that?
 - He also thought it would be helpful to discuss as a committee, what amenities we think are most impactful to ridership, and the rider experience, and build that into a rubric. Like having a covered shelter might be important when considering whether to ride.
 - Stuart Wagner also suggested to look at how Route 1 can be a good steward for riders, the Town, and surrounding properties (for example – low hanging fruit might be adding more trash receptacles).
 - Linda asked if we can survey the public as well – what they are interested in? Stuart recommended that we make sure if we survey that it is more than electronic, and Andy suggested that it include non-riders as well.
 - Question about maintenance – noticing some shopping carts near stops – something to check on regarding maintenance.
 - ACTION: Group is interested in a working session to focus on getting the improvement policy in place prior to the budget.
 - Motion: Stuart - Set up a work session for TAC to determine a policy for amenities, any budget input, and presentation to Town Council.
 - Second: Andy
 - Unanimously passed
 - Katie to send a Doodle poll to schedule meeting
- Next Steps for Transit in Apex
Katie presented updates in this project, and mentioned that Staff just submitted application to the CFA funding program to assist with this task.
 - Andy wanted to follow up on the request from the previous meeting, will this include looking at stop at Senior Center?
 - Still on Town staff to-do list – discussed with Town of Cary, but needs further



conversation internally.

- Andy commented that riders using Senior Center are probably some of our most important ridership demographics. Important to serve in the best way. If we need to change the route, he is supportive of that.
- Nick thought that it should be offered as a courtesy to any senior who wants to get off there?
- Stuart mentioned that GoCary stops at the Cary Senior Center, so that might be a precedent.
- Katie followed up with the revised timeline to allow the Town to use grant funding that staff recently applied for and what the scope would be.
- Veridea Master Subdivision Plan Application
 - The committee discussed and agreed with having a plan established to help guide the development and our work with them. Shannon provided additional background and summarized the proposed changes. She noted that this may move forward to Planning Board and Town Council before this committee again. Katie also summarized the proposed transit plan map changes.
 - Nick thought it was good to have a plan in place ahead of the development.
 - Katie also brought up the Veridea exploratory analysis to determine what type of transit service might be the best fit for the future build out of the West Village of Veridea.

5. Town Grant Application Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

FY24 Wake Transit Community Funding Area Program:

- Planning Project – Transit Priorities for Apex
Katie provided information about this item along with the presentation under item 4. The amount requested from the CFA program was \$22,250. Staff likely will not find out whether the project is recommended for funding until April.
- Capital Project – Bus Stop Improvements
Katie provided information about this item along with the presentation under item 4.
- Capital Project – Saunders and Hinton Sidewalk Connections
Katie provided information about this item along with the presentation under item 4. Katie and Shannon explained that the town also applied for a LAPP grant for this project and that staff recently heard that the project was in the recommended list for LAPP projects. Brett mentioned that although Apex previously had poor success with the LAPP project, but recently it has improved. Shannon also mentioned the LAPP grant is recommended under the Transit category.
Nick asked about the Chatham Street sidewalk project. Shannon explained that it is still in the works, but the federal funding from the LAPP program does extend the timeline compared to local funds, and typically the Town requests LAPP for larger projects because of that. He asked if there was ROW needed for the Saunders and Hinton project.



- Safe Streets and Roads for All (SS4A)
Katie did not have many updates for this grant requests except that notifications on funding awards have not been made at this time.

6. Regional Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

- S-Line TOD Study and Mobility Hubs
Katie and Shannon provided brief updates. The mobility hub project is slated to begin in Spring, with initial engagement likely not until summer.
- CAMPO Mobility Management Implementation Study
- Wake Bus Plan
Katie provided updates that the Draft Bus Plan document was released for an initial staff review. She explained that changes were proposed for Route 305 and the GoCary ACX to make them both all-day services.
Brett asked about the routing changes for Route 305 near Holly Springs. Katie said that it is planned and would require additional stops, but that the Bus Plan includes the assumption that bus stop changes may be needed for new routing.
Katie mentioned that Route 311 is not in the recommended Bus Plan. She mentioned that staff have some questions about the funding for Wake Transit vs other funding. Stuart thought that it might become redundant when the High House route extends north.
Shannon asked about the public comment period for this plan. Katie thought it would be released in February at the same time as the Wake Transit Annual Work Plan.

7. Other Business

The next regularly scheduled meeting date is April 12, 2023.

The meeting was adjourned at 5:40 pm.



Town of Apex Transit Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

February 23rd, 2023

4:00pm-6:00pm

3rd Floor Training Room, Apex Town Hall

Meeting Purpose

The main purpose of this meeting was to discuss the development of a proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy and process, as well as discuss short-term and long-term goals for bus stop improvements in Town.

Meeting Outcomes

Town staff will review comments from the meeting's discussion and send updated proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy to TAC members ahead of the next regular TAC meeting.

Attendees

Committee members:

- Linda Barrett
(joined remotely)
- Nick Bryant
- Amanda Bunce, ex officio
- Kurt Pfeifer
- Angela Reincke, ex officio
- Stuart Wagner
- Andrew Werking

Staff support:

- Shannon Cox
- Katie Schwing
- Jenna Shouse
- Lauren Sisson

Guests:

- Councilor Brett Gantt (Apex Town Council) (joined remotely)

Absent:

- Joanna Helms, ex officio
- David Yokum

1. Welcome and Introductions

Chair Stuart Wagner opened the meeting at 4:04 pm and welcomed the members and guests. There was a round of introductions. The meeting was simultaneously conducted in person and member Linda Barrett and guest Brett Gantt attended remotely. The meeting was also livestreamed to the Town's YouTube page [note: due to audio file corruption, the file is not available for permanent posting on the Town's YouTube page].

2. Bus Stop Improvement Policy presentation – Review from January Meeting

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)



Katie Schwing provided a refresher presentation of the item presented at the January TAC meeting introducing the concept of a bus stop improvement policy and proposed timeline. She reminded the group that one main factor driving this initiative is to assist with the identification and prioritization of improvements that could be implemented using funding that the Town applied for through the Wake Transit Community Funding Area program. Katie added that the Town recently learned that this application progressed past the first round of review and will be considered for the FY24 Wake Transit Work Plan, and if approved, the funding would be in place starting July 1, 2023.

3. Short-term and Long-term Goals for Bus Stop Improvements

(Discussion Item: Town Staff, TAC members, and guests)

Katie Schwing introduced the discussion item to gain a better understanding of the TAC's goals for bus stop improvements. She noted this was in response to a suggestion that Andy Werking made at the January meeting. She provided a framework to consider both 1) short-term goals as those with a one- to three-year time frame, and assuming more concrete projects under the current operating conditions, and 2) long-term goals as those with a three-to-five year-plus time frame, that would include more systemic changes, or take potential future conditions into account.

Katie then presented items to consider for improvements and asked the group if the list was complete in their mind or if they had additional ideas.

Added items:

- Nick – Public art (group acknowledged it may need to be funded separately from the other improvements)
- Mr. Gantt – Smart light poles (with wi-fi)
- Stuart – Wi-fi at bus stops
- Stuart – Digital timing board
- Shannon – Mobility hub improvements (restrooms, bike lockers, etc.)
- Shannon – ADA concrete pad

Katie also presented some high-level cost estimates for some amenities (bench, trash receptacle, bike rack, and shelter) and provided rough examples of how they could be distributed based on an assumption of \$200,000 in funding. Any asked if the cost included maintenance – Katie responded that it did not.

Katie shared some photos of other improvements to get some feedback from the group. There was interest in the solar lighting added to the bus stop post illustrated by a stop in Durham. Stuart Wagner wondered if an emergency call box might be a good idea, especially for those without a cell phone. Katie acknowledged that they require connections to a phone line. Amanda Bunce thought it was a nice idea to provide some comfort and security to customers waiting for the bus. She added that in her experience as a transit rider, lighting did make a difference. Nick proposed that the Town could discuss with Police about specific areas that might need more safety features based on feedback they've received.

Katie also asked the group if they thought improvements of accessibility to and from the stops, like bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure, lighting, crosswalks, bus pullouts and bump outs should be included in this policy.



The group discussed the possibility of adding a second category for mobility hub improvements, such as the items Shannon mentioned and thought it would be a good idea.

The group discussed the possibility of projects like these to be more expensive than the amenities installation, but that in some cases it may be warranted to use the funding for those types of improvements, but they should be considered on a case-by-case basis. Andy Werking suggested that the policy include a clause to include these types of improvements, but limit their use so that it would not be a detriment to the other improvements.

Katie then presented some discussion prompts to help determine the groups thoughts on the following and Jenna Shouse recorded ideas on the powerpoint slide as noted below:

- “All bus stops should at least have...”
 - Stuart – Sign, lighting, ADA pad
 - Nick – ADA pad
 - Stuart – Wouldn’t want to characterize a shelter as a luxury
 - Andy – Trash can
 - Angela – Comment on the responsibility of collecting trash
 - Stuart – A bike rack is not needed at every stop

Angela Reincke brought up the issue of maintenance over time and needing to have a plan and budget in place to empty the trash receptacles, for example. She mentioned that the Parks and Rec Dept has many trash and recycling bins on the greenways, and that it is a regular task to maintain them, but they’ve determined it is worth the effort. She suggested that the group be mindful of that.

Angela also suggested taking areas into account that might be connections to greenways or pedestrian networks, transfers to other routes, etc, and consider bike racks there.

Stuart Wagner acknowledged that, and also wondered if the expense may be outweighed by the expenses incurred if the trash receptacles are not installed (i.e. dealing with litter, complaints, etc).

Shannon said that the bus route operations funding did include some funding for regular maintenance of the stops.

Brett Gantt asked if having a shelter available at a stop has an effect on ridership. Katie said she had seen some studies reporting a correlation, but the actual amount of ridership gained is not clear. However, it could be pretty safe to assume that having a shelter would have a positive effect on ridership.

Andy added that when talking to people, having a shelter is one of the most preferred items.

The group generally agreed that a bus stop sign, lighting, ADA pad, trash can, and bench should be considered basic improvements that all stops should qualify for. Katie mentioned this can be revisited later in the discussion as well.

- “We should ensure that X amount of riders have...”
 - Andy – Question of rider demographics and trip purposes
 - Katie – Census data and rider surveys



Andy Werking asked about the ability to understand demographic information of the riders at the stop level. He wondered if it makes sense to find the core groups so that the Town could ensure that improvements are provided where needed. Katie mentioned that the Town did not have great data for the route yet, and that there are two typical ways to gather this data: from the Census and from rider surveys. She added that GoTriangle is working on a regional customer survey and that staff was 99% sure that GoApex would be included in that survey, tentatively to take place in late April. This would hopefully provide information at the route level, but not the stop level.

Andy asked if the rider apps would have demographic information about their users that could be used to better understand the ridership. He said he would be fairly certain that any app these days has demographic information of all sorts. Katie said she wasn't sure, but could ask GoCary if they knew of demographic data from Transloc or other apps.

- “We should be spending at least/most...”

Andy asked if there was an industry standard for share of costs spent per rider or per operating budget. Katie said from her recollection it can vary widely by agency and depends on the local context. She said there used to be a rule that at least 1% of operating funding agencies received from the FTA 5307 formula funding program would have to be spent on bus stop improvements. She didn't think that was in place anymore, but that some agencies would spend near that level and some much more. She said she could look into it some more to find out. Andy asked if there is an example agency to use as a “gold standard”. Katie said that she thought Portland TriMet might be a good resource because they are good at recording their projects and initiatives and make a lot of improvements.

The group acknowledged that GoApex is in the “startup” phase and may need more investment now to set a standard for the stops, so the spending should probably not be linear. Andy suggested that this could be reviewed annually by the TAC.

4. Qualification Criteria Discussion

(Discussion Item: Town Staff, TAC members, and guests)

Katie presented the idea of using qualification criteria to identify and prioritize improvements at stops. She reminded the group of an initial process introduced at the January TAC meeting that used a matrix of qualification factors and feasibility factors to prioritize groups of stops.

She then provided some examples of how other transit agencies decide on what stops warrant amenities, including GoRaleigh, GoDurham, Charlotte CATS and GRTC Transit System in Richmond, VA.

Stuart & Andy liked Charlotte's approach for long-term stop improvements. They thought that perhaps now, the Town could focus on short-term improvements, but could craft the policy in a way to graduate to this approach.

Brett Gantt suggested to focus on transfer stops.



Andy again suggested that rider demographics would be important to consider in this process.

Katie presented a list of possible criteria to use and asked the group if they thought anything should be added or removed. She mentioned not being sure about the shade option because it might be hard to measure. Katie also suggested adding population characteristics of teenagers or those with disabilities as factors to consider, based on previous discussion. Shannon wondered if the category of population with disabilities might be covered by the paratransit service. Katie mentioned that not all disabilities prevent people from riding the fixed route service, so that might be a reason to include it. Someone mentioned the term “reliant populations” from the example in Charlotte which included both elderly populations and population with a disability.

The group discussed that these could be used, but the qualification threshold could be low for now, since the service is still in a “start-up” phase. The Town also may have a somewhat limited opportunity to use CFA funding for capital projects now rather than later, if Staff apply and receive funding for a second CFA operating project, the Town’s annual “take” of CFA program funding would be higher with less available for capital projects.

Someone asked about expanding the land use/destinations list to include civic spaces, basic needs, places like Western Wake Crisis Ministries, etc.

Andy asked if we have surveys asking what riders want to see. Jenna mentioned that the GoApex Circulator Study did include outreach about this, and we could review to see what was said.

Shannon posed a question to the group. She noted that sometimes, funding opportunities present themselves that the Town may want to pursue that may not necessarily be the same priority order as our policy. Should we still pursue those projects? Stuart thought that it made sense to try to maximize grant funding opportunities, even if it is not in the policy order. Others agreed.

Nick Bryant asked a question that was prompted by the Raleigh example, in that they have bus stop improvement requirements for new developments on bus routes. He wondered if the next route for GoApex had been identified yet, and if we have started requiring developers to place bus stops? Katie replied that the Town has not identified a second route yet, but we do have the proposed future local routes in the Transit Plan map. Shannon said that staff has been working to identify locations where it makes sense to work with developers to add future stop locations.

5. Feasibility Considerations Discussion

(Discussion Item: Town Staff, TAC members, and guests)

Katie provided a brief explanation of feasibility considerations and noted that challenges could occur at almost every stage of the bus stop improvement process, from identification to installation. She noted the challenges could affect the amount of time and money needed to make improvements.

Andy wondered if it made sense to try to get a ballpark rating for feasibility before stops move to the implementation stage, as was initially proposed in the matrix example. Shannon thought it might be a cost consideration, since this work can be time consuming and would probably require an engineer. Andy then wondered if there could be a short list of the highest priority areas that could be done first, and then if



issues are identified, move down the list. Shannon agreed that could be a practical approach.

Andy made a comment that in his mind, if it got to the point where it would be less expensive to move a stop than try to make improvements in the current location, that could be a marker of a “tipping point” where feasibility should prevent the stop from being improved in the current location.

6. Discussion on Overall Prioritization Method

(Discussion Item: Town Staff, TAC members, and guests)

Katie asked for any final thoughts on the proposed process and discussion items. She asked the group if they were comfortable with the overall idea, if there was anything missing, or if anything seemed overly complicated. Overall, it seemed the group was ok with moving forward with such a policy, with the details to be refined based on the meeting’s discussion.

Katie reminded the group of the next steps and that staff plan to send a draft policy for the Committee’s review prior to the April TAC meeting.

7. Other Business

The next regularly scheduled meeting date is April 12, 2023.

8. Closing

Chair Stuart Wagner thanked the committee members for attending the special meeting, as well as the Town Clerk’s office for the meeting setup. The meeting was adjourned at 6:04 pm.



Town of Apex Transit Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

April 12, 2023

4:00pm-5:30pm

3rd Floor Training Room, Apex Town Hall

Meeting Purpose

The main purpose of this meeting was to discuss GoApex service performance, provide follow ups from TAC members questions, provide updates and request a recommendation on the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy, and share updates on transit-related town and regional projects.

Meeting Outcomes

Town staff will move forward with the public comment period for the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy with changes as noted in these minutes and provide the results for the TAC to review prior to sending to Town Council for approval.

Attendees

Committee members:

- Linda Barrett
- Nick Bryant
- Amanda Bunce, ex officio
- Kurt Pfeifer
- Angela Reincke, ex officio
- Stuart Wagner
- Andrew Werking
- David Yokum

Absent:

- Joanna Helms, ex officio
- Kurt Pfeifer

Staff support:

- Shannon Cox
- Katie Schwing
- Lauren Sisson

Guests:

- Councilor Brett Gantt (Apex Town Council)
- Evan Koff, Senior Wake Transit Planner, Capitol Area MPO
- Amanda Mellenberger and members of Girl Scout Troop 360

1. Welcome and Introductions

Chair Stuart Wagner opened the meeting at 4:04pm and welcomed the members and guests. There was a round of introductions.

2. Meeting Minutes

(Action Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

The committee reviewed the draft minutes from the January 11th, 2023 meeting and the February 23rd, 2023 Special meeting. There were no corrections noted.

- Member Nick Bryant made a motion to approve the January 11th, 2023 meeting minutes.



- Member Linda Barrett seconded the motion to approve the January 11th, 2023 meeting minutes.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.
- Member Andy Werking made a motion to approve the February 23rd, 2023 meeting minutes.
- Member David Yokum seconded the motion to approve the February 23rd, 2023 meeting minutes.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.

Chair Stuart Wagner also called for a motion to amend the meeting agenda to include an action item on the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy.

- Member Andy Werking made a motion to amend the agenda.
- Member David Yokum seconded the motion to amend the agenda.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.

3. GoApex Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Katie Schwing provided updates on GoApex ridership and performance data. She also provided some information based on questions from TAC members at previous meetings. Information included:

- Monthly ridership for December 2022, January 2023, February 2023, and March 2023
- Monthly On-time performance for December 2022, January 2023, February 2023, and March 2023
 - Andy Werking asked if this can be looked at with a finer grain to determine ways to improve it – for example, can we look at this data by day or the week, by operator, by weather conditions, etc.? Katie said she hadn't looked at it in that much detail, but that could be investigated.
- Average Boardings per trip, by Day of Week
- On-time Performance by Timepoint
 - Andy Werking asked what can be done to improve on-time at a particular timepoint, specifically referencing stop #16021 at Chick-fil-A. Katie replied that the best option, given the overall on-time performance of the route, would be to try to adjust the run time to allow an extra minute or two for the operator to get to that stop, and she thought that Cary would be willing to work with the Town if needed.
- Comparison of Farebox and APC data
 - Andy thought it was a good sign that although there was an almost 20% difference in the numbers, they were fairly consistent quarter to quarter.
- Comparison of GoApex Route 1 and the Wake Forest Loop
 - Evan Koff provided some additional background information on the route. Evan said that Apex is still in the developmental stage so our routes aren't measured by minimum targets at this time; however, Apex is hitting year 3 targets.
 - Brett Gantt asked Evan for any insights on if the frequency on a route is doubled, does the ridership double? Evan said the decision to increase frequency varies based on the type of service. For some busy routes, like the Route 21 in Raleigh, the decision to increase frequency was led by the fact that the vehicle was hitting maximum load levels often. For other routes, it may take time to build up the ridership base.



- Brett asked if in areas with more choice riders, it could provide more attraction to the service if it was more convenient (i.e. higher frequency). Evan mentioned that providing good real-time service information can help make the wait less burdensome to riders, which might help with that. He further added that the number one importance is reliability and the second is frequency.
- GoApex Door to Door Performance Summary

4. Town Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing and Shannon Cox, Town of Apex)

Katie provided updates on the following projects:

- Bus Stop Sidewalk Art Project
 - The group thought it was a great sign that there were so many entries (eighteen). Members also expressed that they were excited to see the project implemented as it is different from other transit art projects in the region.
- Proposed Bus Stop Improvements Policy and Process
 - Katie presented the proposed Bus Stop improvement policy and process and supplied handouts for review. Katie would like to submit the policy to the public for comments and then take it to the Town Council.
 - The group discussed the weighting the public requests should have on the detailed methodology qualification process, with the concern that public requests shouldn't be able to negate all the other factors. A suggestion was weight based on the number of requests. Suggestion with general agreement was 1-5 requests = 1 point, >5 requests = 2 points.
 - Add a point for "Committee Priority" for special circumstances addressing priorities by the TAC group.
 - **Action Item:** The TAC recommends that the Town Council approves the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy pending a public comment period with the revision to add consideration of long-term plans as a possible deviation.
- Follow up on Shopping Carts at Bus Stops
 - Katie presented the data findings from Robbie Addington in the Planning Department about shopping carts at bus stops. It is a nationwide issue, but thus far has not been a major issue in Apex. She noted it is worth being proactive on this issue, though.
 - Nick Bryant wondered if we can re-examine where some of our bus stops are located in order to minimize walking.
 - Stuart Wagner wondered if there could be an initiative to have small foldable shopping trolleys available on the bus for people to use instead of having to use a store's cart to get to the bus stop.
- Next Steps for Transit in Apex
 - Katie mentioned that there weren't many updates for this project for this meeting, but there likely will be at the July meeting.



- Katie shared that Shannon suggested the PeakFest on May 6th might be a good opportunity to get some initial public feedback.
- Andy thought that was a good idea, and thought some questions related to teens and parents might be useful, such as what their attitudes are towards riding the bus, if they would allow teens to ride by themselves, etc.

5. Town Grant Application Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Katie gave quick updates on the applications to the Wake Transit Community Funding Area Program and the Safe Streets and roads for All program.

- The CFA grants have moved to the Recommended FY24 Wake Transit Annual Work Plan
- Apex did not receive the 2022 SS4A grant, but the new application cycle is already open and the Town plans to make another application for 2023.

6. Regional Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

- S-Line TOD Study and Mobility Hubs
 - No updates at this time
- Wake Bus Plan
 - Katie shared that the joint public engagement period for the Wake Bus Plan and Wake Transit Annual Work Plan ended on March 22nd, and CAMPO shared comments relevant to Apex. Katie included them as a meeting handout. Stuart noticed that there were several comments related to bus frequency.

4. Other Business

The next regularly scheduled meeting date is July 12, 2023.

Katie also shared that Apex PeakFest is coming up on Saturday, May 6th, and asked if any members were interested in helping out with the Planning booth to let her know.

PeakFest

5. Closing

The meeting was adjourned at 5:40 pm.



Town of Apex Transit Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

July 12, 2023

4:00pm-5:30pm

3rd Floor Training Room, Apex Town Hall

Meeting Purpose

The main purpose of this meeting was to discuss GoApex service performance, provide follow ups from TAC members questions, provide updates and request a recommendation on the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy, and share updates on transit-related town and regional projects.

Meeting Outcomes

Town staff will revise the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy with changes as noted in these minutes prior to sending to Town Council for approval.

Attendees

Committee members:

- Linda Barrett
- Nick Bryant
- Amanda Bunce, ex officio
- Joanna Helms, ex officio
- Kurt Pfeifer
- Stuart Wagner
- Andrew Werking

Staff support:

- Shannon Cox
- Katie Schwing

Guests:

- Councilor Brett Gantt (Apex Town Council)
- Corey Canty, Apex resident

Absent:

- Angela Reincke, ex officio
- David Yokum

1. Welcome and Introductions

Chair Stuart Wagner opened the meeting at 4:02pm and welcomed the members and guests. There was a round of introductions.

2. Meeting Minutes

(Action Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

The committee reviewed the draft minutes from the April 12th, 2023 regular meeting. There were no corrections noted.

- Member Andy Werking made a motion to approve the April 12th, 2023 meeting minutes.
- Member Linda Barrett seconded the motion to approve the April 12th, 2023 meeting minutes.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.



3. GoApex Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Katie Schwing provided updates on GoApex ridership and performance data. Information included:

- Graph of Monthly ridership, cost per boarding, and on-time percentage for April, May, and June, 2023
 - Notable dates with high ridership were April 1st and 4th (WCPSS Spring Break), May 6th (PeakFest) and June 10th (Pride Fest)
 - There was no service on Monday, May 29th (Memorial Day)
- Graph of Average Boardings per Revenue Hour by Month, FY23
 - The group noted a generally upward trend
- Quarterly Automated Passenger Counter (APC) data (to be used for relative differences) for:
 - Graph of Average daily Boardings by Trip, by Quarter
 - Katie noted that it seemed the later evening trips were lower in the winter months and higher in the summer months
 - Map of Average Daily Boardings by Stop, for Q4 only
 - The group noted the stops with higher ridership, such as the Kelly Rd, Tingen Rd, Beaver Creek Commons Drive, and Hunter Street at Town Hall stops
- GoApex Door to Door Performance Summary
 - The group noted an upward trend in GoApex Door to Door ridership and wondered what could have caused the change. Linda Barrett mentioned the information session with Wakemed in April that provided information on the service to several case managers. Katie mentioned an event at the Senior Center in February that provided information on the service. Katie also thought it could partially be due to just greater awareness of the service over time. She also mentioned that she had recently worked with GoWake Access to shift the scheduling policy to set Door to Door trip pickup 30 minutes before scheduled arrival time due to the short distance of these trips, instead of 1hr, per the general county-wide policy, which might make the service more convenient for riders.
 - The group thought it would be important to continue outreach about the service. Katie mentioned that staff are planning to attend the Health and Wellness Fair at the Senior Center in September and will look for other opportunities.
- Real-time Transit Information Updates
 - Katie shared that the regional contract for Transloc and the Golive text arrivals ended on July 1st.
 - She shared that GoTriangle has been working to get the regional transit services into a new app, called UMO Mobility, that will show real-time info.
 - She also shared that GoCary is working on an app called MyRide that would include GoApex Route 1.
 - Katie also shared that different transit providers in the region are going with different real-time options, in light of the Transloc contract ending.
 - Nick asked about the reasons for the contract ending. Why not continue it rather than have no contract? He also asked if the UMO app is intended to be the long-term solution. Katie said she wasn't sure, but that GoTriangle and some other partner agencies had already entered into an agreement with UMO Mobility for their mobile ticketing services



(which are not being used right now because of current fare-free policies), so it was a quick solution. Not all of the providers are on that contract (such as the universities), but she thought it might still have their route info on it.

- Amanda asked if they are considering Google Maps GTFS real-time. Katie said she thought that a few of the agencies are exploring the GTFS real-time options.
- Several members asked why there wasn't an organized regional approach to addressing this issue. The members consider this to be a big issue in terms of communicating this change to riders as well as coming up with a permanent solution.
- Stuart asked if Apex had received any customer feedback yet. Katie said she had not, but that Transloc may have been out of service for only a few days at this point.
- Nick downloaded the UMO and noted he couldn't see the bus in motion, and thought that was an important piece of the Transloc service (to be able to see the bus vs just the estimated arrival time).
- The group asked if Staff had discussed these issues with GoTriangle and if there was a regional discussion about what to do. Katie said there had been calls she'd been a part of, but it seemed more like each transit provider is making their own plans on how to move forward.
- Stuart asked if there is a way to provide feedback to advocate for a permanent regional solution for the real-time information. Shannon mentioned that the monthly Wake Transit TPAC (Transit Planning Advisory Committee) has a public comment period at the beginning of each meeting and that is an opportunity to communicate with all the Wake Transit Partner agencies.
- Stuart said he might be interested in that and Katie said she could provide the contact information.
- Stuart also asked for contact information for GoTriangle to share the TAC's thoughts on the real-time information solutions and Katie said she could also provide that contact information.
- Proposed Stop at the Apex Senior Center
 - Katie shared that Staff are working to implement a new GoApex Bus Stop near the front entrance of the Apex Senior Center. She said that she and Shannon are planning to meet GoCary staff there on July 18th to test it out and try to identify a stop location.
 - She shared that the intent is to make the change for GoCary's October service change
 - The group expressed support for this change
- Updates to the Ride Guide and Map
 - Katie shared that because of the proposed routing change and real-time information updates, Staff will need to update the GoApex Ride Guides and Map
 - Nick asked if there will be a stop at the Senior Center entrance, could the layover location be moved to this stop, and that way the seniors would not have to wait at the layover after boarding? He also thought the bus could park over near the Hughes St entrance and circle back around before departing. Katie said she could ask GoCary about that idea.

4. Town Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing and Shannon Cox, Town of Apex)

Katie provided updates on the following projects:



- Bus Stop Sidewalk Art Project
 - Katie shared that since the last meeting, the artists have been selected, NCDOT has granted conditional approval on the design concepts, and Staff are currently waiting a decision on the NCDOT encroachment permit.
 - She said she would be working to schedule installations soon. Nick suggested installations on Sunday to minimize impact to GoApex operations.
 - Andy asked if Staff had considered ways to do marketing and outreach for the project, such as a Bus Stop Bingo or themed giveaway for seeing all the installations.
 - Staff said that it will be part of the Apex 150th Anniversary activities, likely in October, and they can plan for other ideas.
 - Joanna said she could share a template for a “Vote for Your Favorite” campaign.

- Proposed Bus Stop Improvements Policy and Process
 - Katie updated the group on the activities for this task since the April meeting. There was a public comment survey out from May 5th to June 5th, 2023. Based on the survey results and some internal discussions with Town Staff, Staff decided not to take the proposed policy to Town Council and wanted to bring three proposed changes to the group for discussion.
 - 1. Add information Boxes with Route Map and Schedule Information to the Standard Improvements
 - The group agreed with the proposed change
 - 2. Remove trash cans from the Enhanced Improvements and move to a Remove Trash Receptacles from the Enhanced Improvements and move to a Case-by-Case approval by staff in coordination with Public Works
 - Andy asked if this is based on a temporary capacity constraint, could the policy not still refer to the permanent intent?
 - The group thought it could always be changed later if needed
 - 3. Document Edit under Bus Stop Descriptions:
 - GoApex bus stops should meet requirements of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and Public Access Right-of-way Guidelines (PROWAG) and follow the Apex bus stop standard engineering specifications available at: <https://www.apexnc.org/197/Engineering-Specifications>. Premium materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis.
 - The group asked for more details about the impact of this proposed change. Andy asked why Apex had decided to make this change, and if Staff had a sense of what the impacts would be. He wondered if it might be unrealistic to expect all bus stops to meet these requirements, considering the existing context of some of the stops. He also wondered if meeting this requirement would reduce the amount of amenities the Town could install. He said he was unlikely to support this change until that was known.
 - Linda asked if there was an ADA expert who was already reviewing the stops. Katie replied that the GoApex stops did go through the Town’s development review, but that the basic ADA requirements are not quite the same as the PROWAG requirements. Shannon shared that there is planned to be a staff member who will be assigned to review for PROWAG moving forward.



- Stuart asked if the existing stops could be grandfathered in somehow, and then any new stops would be subject to this proposed change?
 - Amanda thought it would be easier for this to work with new developments, since they usually have more space to work with.
 - Andy asked if this discussion was a moot point if the Town had already decided to start making this change.
 - Finally, Andy asked which of these stops selected for the GoApex Bus Stop Art Project might be affected by this change? Katie said she could find out.
 - The group talked about understanding the need for PROWAG but had questions about the impact on providing improvements in the near term. Andy wondered if there are amenities with a smaller footprint that could be placed in some areas to avoid large grading or ROW projects.
 - Shannon and Katie agreed that Staff would bring back additional information and continue to work through the prioritization process to get a gauge of the potential impacts, and bring the results back to the group.
 - **Action Item:** The TAC recommends that the Town Council approves the proposed Bus Stop Improvement Policy with proposed changes to add Information Boxes as Standard Improvements and remove trash receptacles as Enhanced Improvements and change to approval by staff on a case-by-case basis, and not recommend a proposed change to add PROWAG Guidelines to required specifications at this time.
- Follow up on Shopping Carts at Bus Stops
 - Katie said there were no major updates but that Staff are still considering long-term strategies for addressing this issue
 - Next Steps for Transit in Apex
 - Katie shared that Staff have begun working on compiling key points from previous planning efforts that should be considered in this project. Staff are also working through the process to access the Remix Transit Planning software, and should have access in August. She also shared that the public survey is likely to happen around November.
 - She also shared the results from a public outreach exercise from PeakFest in May. A poster asked what the Town should prioritize next for transit. The top two responses were increase service frequency on Route 1 and Add a new fixed route.

5. Town Grant Application Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Katie gave quick updates on the applications to the Wake Transit Community Funding Area Program and the Safe Streets and Roads for All program.

- The CFA grants were approved as part of the approval in June of the FY24 Wake Transit Annual Work Plan
- The Town applied for the 2023 round of the Safe Streets and Roads for all (SS4A) program, and the Town's proposed project scope includes ADA improvements to five bus stops along W Williams St. The Town expects to hear whether or not we were selected around the end of the year.



6. Regional Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

- S-Line TOD Study and Mobility Hubs
 - The S-Line TOD is wrapping up and Apex’s “Community Playbook” document will be posted to the state’s project website soon, and a presentation is scheduled for the September 12th Town Council Meeting
 - The Mobility Hubs project is still set to begin in 2023.

- Wake Bus Plan
 - The Wake Bus Plan is set to go before the CAMPO and GoTriangle boards for approval in August.

4. Other Business

The next regularly scheduled meeting date is tentatively scheduled for October 11, 2023.

5. Closing

The meeting was adjourned at 5:43 pm.



Town of Apex Transit Advisory Committee

Meeting Minutes

October 11, 2023

4:00pm-5:30pm

3rd Floor Training Room, Apex Town Hall

Meeting Purpose

The purpose of the meeting was to provide updates on various transit-related projects, as well as request recommendations for Town Council to approve the draft Bus Stop Improvement Policy and proposed Transit Plan Map amendment showing future GoApex Route 1 service to the Apex Senior Center.

Meeting Outcomes

The TAC unanimously approved a recommendation for Town Council to approve the draft Bus Stop Improvement Policy and proposed Transit Plan Map amendment showing future GoApex Route 1 service to the Apex Senior Center. Staff will continue to update the TAC on the studies and projects.

Attendees

Committee members:

- Linda Barrett
- Nick Bryant (arrived late)
- Kurt Pfeifer
- Stuart Wagner
- Andrew Werking

Absent:

- Angela Reincke, ex officio
- Amanda Bunce, ex officio
- Joanna Helms, ex officio
- David Yokum

Staff support:

- Shannon Cox
- Katie Schwing
- Lauren Sisson

Guests:

- Councilor Brett Gantt (Apex Town Council)
- Amanda Mellenberger and Members of Girl Scout Troop 360
- Chris Johnson, Apex Transportation, Infrastructure, and (TID) Director

1. Welcome and Introductions

Chair Stuart Wagner opened the meeting at 4:02pm and welcomed the members and guests. There was a round of introductions.

Amanda Mellenberger, Girl Scout Troop 360 Leader, made a brief presentation with a member of the Troop. The Scouts would like to work on a project on how the youth can help the Town of Apex over time that is sustainable, and their topic so far is youth awareness about GoApex. They would like to target Middle School and High School ages to help increase ridership in that age bracket. The Scouts sent surveys to group that represented 6th graders to adults. They have the results from 100 responses.

Amanda plans to solicit adults on Facebook to encourage their children to respond to the next survey. They



would like to gather another 100 responses to be able to compare the data with the first set of results. The Scouts would like to set up something at the Christmas Parade this year to help increase awareness of the service. They have made a deadline by the end of the year to finalize the results of both surveys.

2. Meeting Minutes

(Action Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

The committee reviewed the draft minutes from the July 12th, 2023 regular meeting. There were no corrections noted.

- Member Kurt Pfeifer made a motion to approve the July 12th, 2023 meeting minutes.
- Member Linda Barrett seconded the motion to approve the July 12th, 2023 meeting minutes.
- The motion was unanimously approved by the Committee.

3. Town Project Updates

(Informational and Action Items: Katie Schwing and Shannon Cox, Town of Apex)

Proposed Bus Stop Improvements Policy and Process

Katie provided updates since the July TAC meeting. After that meeting, Town Staff continued to discuss the interpretation of the federal Public Right-of-way Access Guidelines (PROWAG) and decided not to take this to Council. On September 7th, 2023 a final rule was issued from the federal government, making PROWAG law.

Staff also updated the policy as a result of feedback from the TAC, and there was new language added to the policy to allow for technical infeasibility as a possible reason for deviation from the policy. Andy requested a better understanding of what specifically counted as technical infeasibility. Shannon referenced 36 CFR §1190.

Andy brought up the observation that he thought trash cans are needed at each bus stop. Chris Johnson addressed that the placement of the improvements are critical to not create a hazardous situation. Katie requested to present this revised policy at the next council meeting.

- **Recommended Action:** Recommend Town Council approval of the revised Bus Stop Improvement Policy
- Andy Werking made the motion to approve the recommendation as presented. Linda Barrett seconded the motion. It passed unanimously.

Proposed Stop at the Apex Senior Center

Katie provided updates on the proposed placement of a bus stop at the main entrance to the Apex Senior Center. There was a question about whether stop could be under the main porte-cochere/canopy. Katie explained that in testing out the routing and discussing with Parks, Rec, and Cultural Resources Staff, there is a need to have the covered area remain open as a loading zone for the seniors frequenting the Center, and the bus would need more space to pull flush to the curb for boarding and alighting, so the bus stop sign is planned to be placed in front of the covered area and a bench placed.

Andy would like to see a firm plan and date for a shelter, and to place the bus stop sign closer to the placement of the bench. Katie said she would need to review again to make sure that was feasible.



Katie noted that the Planning Board had unanimously recommended approval of the proposed amendment at their October 9, 2023 meeting.

- **Recommended Action:** Recommend Town Council approval of the proposed Transit Plan map amendment to show routing to the Apex Senior Center main entrance.
- Andy Werking made the motion to approve the recommendation as presented. Kurt Pfeifer seconded the motion. It passed unanimously.

Bus Stop Sidewalk Art Project

Katie provided updates on the project, noting that since the last meeting four stops had been installed and a fifth was in progress. The needed encroachment permit to install public art in the NCDOT right of way had been approved on September 19th. Stuart asked if there was a plan for communications of the project for awareness building and showcasing the project. Katie said that she had some discussion with the Communications Dept and the plan at this point is to wait until the installations are complete, then to have a campaign including a map with the art locations, a channel card for the bus, a social media reel (video) highlighting locations, and a Suburban Living article featuring photos of the art. Stuart noted what great ambassadors the artists have been as people have stopped to see the work in progress.

Transit Prioritization Study

Katie shared that the timeline for this project is delayed, mostly due to staff time constraints, but that some progress had been made since the July meeting. Part 1 was underway (compiling, review of past requests, Remix account software set up) and that the public survey was still planned, but now will be winter rather than fall. Andy asked for more details about what the Remix software offers, and Katie shared that it makes planning level activities much faster because it's a map-based software specific for transit planning. It already includes the roadway network, socioeconomic, ridership, and population data, and helps determine how many stops are needed in an area. Can upload other information to gather the data you want to help plan. Katie shared that as of now, Staff are still aiming for the FY24 timeline.

Kurt mentioned that adding Sunday service seems like low-hanging fruit, and others agreed. Mr. Gantt asked for more information about what role the TAC should play in the project, and if it makes sense for them to vet through materials or options ahead of the public survey going out, and be involved in like an opportunity to be involved in what is put on the table for prioritization. Katie thought that was a good idea and said she would discuss with Shannon and plan to send an email update regarding plan of action for TAC involvement prior to public input.

4. Town Grant Application Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Shannon discussed the S-Line mobility Hub RAISE Grant initiative. Since the last meeting, the feasibility study grant has been awarded and NCDOT is currently preparing to release the RFP. In addition, since the July meeting NCDOT shared with the Town that they are pursuing a grant through the federal



Reconnecting Communities and Neighborhoods (RCN) Grant Initiative for a further project for the S-Line Mobility Hubs. The application has been submitted to this competitive federal program, and staff are not sure of the probability of the project being selected. The scope is for the final design of the mobility hub. The draft budget is \$2.3 million, with a match from the Town of \$460,000.

Katie reviewed the approved FY24 requests for the Wake Transit Community Funding Area program, including, bus stop improvements, Saunders/Hinton sidewalk connections, GoApex Route 1 and Door to Door continued operations, and the Transit Prioritization Study. Matching funds are being received for these projects.

Mr. Gantt asked whether the TAC could be helpful in increasing the Community Funding Area pot of funds. Katie explained that there is an amendment proposed for the FY24 Annual Work Plan that would extend the timeline for the CFA Program Management Plan update to correspond with the Wake Transit Vision Plan update, which is a two-year process. Staff have conveyed this timeline concern to the CAMPO Wake Transit staff. As far as other options, staff will think about how else we can have these concerns addressed. Possible ideas are the TPAC approval process (do we need to vote against amendment?) or can we think of compromise requests like a milestone schedule that puts the CFAP in an early phase?

Katie discussed possible Wake Transit funding requests for FY25: S-Line mobility hub design match, adding Sunday service to GoApex Route 1 and GoApex Door to Door, covering some costs of adding a planner who would assist with transit tasks, adding a financial audit budget and adding annual bus stop improvements. The initial funding request is due Friday, October 13, 2023, and the plan at this point is to add everything in, with the possibility of backing items out of the request later if needed to help show what funding is needed.

Shannon added that Staff are currently working on the Town's FY25 capital improvement plan, and that design funding for bus routes is shown in FY25 and costs for adding another route are shown in FY26.

5. Regional Project Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing and Shannon Cox, Town of Apex)

Katie shared updates on the CDBG project that the Town partnered with Wake County on to add bus stop shelters in four locations noted on the presentation slide. The ROW and easement acquisition are complete, construction plan signature set has been submitted and the project will be out for bid soon. Multiple months for the contract process is anticipated.

S-Line Transit-Oriented Development Study is complete and available on the NCDOT website, and provides recommendations that the Town could choose to implement.

Katie also shared that the Wake Bus Plan update was approved in August.

6. GoApex Updates

(Informational Item: Katie Schwing, Town of Apex)

Operations and performance data:



Andy noted that the data showed August 2023 had the highest ridership and the lowest costs per passenger so far. Katie noted that new software was added for the GoWake Access system in July, so Staff only have July 2023 data for the ADA paratransit performance summary at this time.

Real-time Transit information:

Katie provided brief updates and share that GoTriangle is working on bringing back the GoLive text service. January/February GoCary/GoApex should be back online. GoCary is working on launching their GoCary MyRide app to include GoApex Route 1. Staff is trying to get a proposal from their app developer to create a GoApex specific app but no response yet.

The group discussed the new UMO mobility app. Nick stated that the app isn't really helpful. There is no prompt to get home from location x. The group asked if the new app was being advertised so people at least know about it. Katie said a channel card can be added to the bus.

Katie shared that Staff are working on an Annual report for GoApex, hitting highlights of costs, ridership, etc. and plan to add it to the webpage when complete.

Nick asked if staff had heard negative feedback from reported numbers. Katie said there have been mostly questions and not comments.

Andy asked rhetorically why there is a need to present such detailed information for transit service when other offered Town services do not provide any per person use cost information, etc. Katie said to partially answer the question, there is a history of reporting such data for federally-funded transit service, and although GoApex does not currently receive federal funding, there is a precedent for that detailed transit data.

4. Other Business

The next regularly scheduled meeting date is tentatively scheduled for January 10, 2024.

Staff requested if January 17, 2024 would be a suitable alternative.

Stuart made the motion and Kurt seconded. It was approved.

5. Closing

The meeting was adjourned around 5:40pm.